



Social Audit of Water and Sanitation Schemes

A Pilot Project In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa



Social Audit of Water and Sanitation Schemes

A Pilot Project In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Contents

Abbreviations.....	ii
Contextual Background.....	1
What is social audit?	2
The Project:.....	3
Rational:.....	3
Objective of the Project	3
The Process:.....	4
Using Community Social Audit tool kit:.....	4
Step-I:.....	5
Preparatory Activities.....	5
Step-II:.....	5
Social Audit Scope	5
Step- III	5
Community Awareness and Training on Social Audit	5
Participatory Approach	6
Public Service Delivery Mechanism	6
Planning commission documents (PC)	7
• Planning Commission (PC) 1	7
• Planning Commission (PC) 2	7
• Planning Commission (PC) 3	7
• Planning Commission (PC) 4	8
• Planning Commission (PC) 5	8
Social Mapping	8
Using KP Right to Information Act, 2013	8
Step IV.....	10
Data collection and Analysis:.....	10
Step V.....	11
Public Disclosure	11
Conclusion.....	15
Annexures	19
Annexure – I : Sample RTI Request.....	19
Annexure – II : Water Testing Result	20
Annexure – III: Media Coverages.....	21
Annexure – IV: Pictures Gallery	22

Abbreviations

ADP	Annual Development Program
BHU	Basic Health Unit
CGPA	Centre for Governance and Public Accountability
CSA	Community Social Audit
DCE	Detailed Cost Estimate
DEO	District Education Officer
GGMS	Government Girls Middle School
GGPS	Government Girls Primary School
KP	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LG	Local Government
MPA	Member Provincial Assembly
PC	Planning commission
PHED	Public Health and Engineering Department
RTI	Right to Information
RTS	Right to Services
UC	Union Council
XEN	Executive Engineer

Contextual Background

Political system in Pakistan is characterized by low transparency and weak accountability, especially in terms of having effective and functional accountability mechanisms that are rooted in civil society and democratic processes. People in electoral constituencies, especially in rural parts, are generally unaware of their legal rights, and lack organizational and technical resources to make their representatives and governments (i.e. local, provincial and national) accountable. Many of them do not realize that government funds are basically public funds, as these are raised through taxes, which almost everybody in the country pays. It is largely because (a) about 50% people are illiterate; (b) level of political and civic education remains low as a result of weak civil society and frequent disruptions in the democratic process; and (c) most of the taxes are collected indirectly and hence people fail to realize that they are taxpayers. Corruption, inefficiencies and mismanagement are other factors that take heavy toll on human lives and economy.

Sanitation and drinking water are universally accepted as essential for human life, dignity and human development. However, water and sanitation services are in dismal state in Pakistan. According to Pakistan Council for Research on Water Resources (PCRWR) 2012 report, in Pakistan, an estimated 250,000 child deaths occur due to water borne diseases. The estimated cost of water borne diseases is Rs. 114 billion, or approximately 1.81% of GDP¹. According to UNICEF, up-to 40% of hospital admissions in Pakistan can be attributed to water-borne diseases.

The departments responsible for provision of clean drinking water are often politicized. The Members of Provincial Assembly (MPAs) are generally using the development funds for water and sanitation for their political ambitions. Public Health and Engineering Department development schemes have never been socially audited in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. All the schemes estimated by district PHED department are indicated by the MPs, after which a lump sum amount is allocated to the district. There is great likelihood that MPs discretion violates the other important factors required for project feasibility like needs of the communities, number of beneficiaries and other feasibilities studies.

The new legal framework in KP provides conducive environment for social audit of PHED. KP government has recently passed a) Right to Information Act 2013 b) Right to Public Services Act 2014 c) Local Government Act 2013 d) Ehtisab Commission Act 2014 and e) whistle blowers protection Act. These laws will be very effective for the social audit of the selected schemes of the PHED in district Mardan of KP. Furthermore, local government structures are recently

¹ <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-6-85963-250000-child-deaths-occur-annually-in-Pakistan-due-to-unsafe-water>

formed under which PHED is devolved to the district government. However, laws are as good as their implementation. These laws can only benefit citizens if are utilized for ensuring transparent and accountable public services delivery and attainment of basic rights. These laws can't make improvement in the public service delivery until they are brought into social discourse and are used by citizens for holding their public service providers and elected representatives accountable.

Governments are facing an ever-growing demand to be more accountable, transparent and socially responsible while the public is becoming more assertive about its right to be informed and to influence governments' decision-making processes. Social Audit gives an understanding of the administrative system from the perspective of the vast majority of people in the society for whom the very institutional/administrative system is being promoted and legitimized. e.g.

- Are public bodies really accessible to the public?
- Are development schemes i.e. road, hospital, school benefiting those for whom they were constructed?
- Are there any implications on socio economic conditions of the community for whom such development schemes are constructed?
- If and how public bodies are responsive to the demands of the community?

What is social audit?

The term Social Audit can be traced back to 1950's, when it as used for measuring and reporting the social benefits of business and public sector interventions. Today, it is used as a way of measuring, understanding, reporting and ultimately improving the social performance of government departments. Social audit has an impact on governance as it values the voice of the stakeholders and measures social performance in order to achieve improvement as well as to report accurately on what has been done. Social audit can be done at any stage of the planning and implementation of a scheme/program or even after the completion of a project.

Social audit has broader as well as direct impacts. At broader level social audit process can impact in a responsive and well-equipped society while directs impact leads to improve accountability and transparency.

Public agencies are given mandates and funds, but their performances are not properly assessed and communities seldom take any action to hold them accountable. Public audits of accounts and parliamentary reviews are done, but follow up actions may leave much to be desired. It is clear that the existence of formal mechanisms of accountability does not guarantee actual accountability on the ground. These discouraging outcomes have been attributed to a variety of factors. Collusion between those who are responsible for performance

and those who are charged with their oversight due to the asymmetry of information and the prevalence of corruption are among the factors often highlighted in this context. Delivery of good governance has been a major casualty in this process. Social Audit is an innovative mechanism that can create the enabling conditions for public accountability.

Social audit is founded on two main principles;

- The people must be at the center of governance
- Development is a right, not a privilege or to be obliged

The very essence of governance is to realize the systematic, sustainable development of the people. Development must be for each person and for all persons equally. The people must be the focal point of all development initiatives.

The Project:

In this particular project, the principles of social audit: accountability, transparency, disclosure of information, multi-level and multi-stakeholders perspective, verification of information and participation of stakeholders were followed for auditing the social impact of water and sanitation schemes in district Mardan. The data about the schemes was collected by the citizen by using the Right to Information Law. The citizens were enabled to demand for an accountable and transparent public services delivery mechanism.

Rational:

One of the problems that citizens face in addressing service-related issues is their lack of knowledge and information on these matters. They end up protesting and writing to the press on an anecdotal basis that may solve some individual problems but do not solve the systemic problems in service provision. This project was initiated with the aim of strengthening citizen's voice for demanding timely and quality service delivery.

Objective of the Project

The project had following key objectives:

- Community voices strengthened for accountable and transparent services delivery of water and sanitation services.
- Evidence generated for policy advocacy on accountable and transparent public water and sanitation.

The Process:

Using Community Social Audit tool kit:

Community Social Audit was chosen as an analysis tool, given its nature and scope, for achieving the stated objectives. Diagram below provides an overview of the process,



Step-I:

Preparatory Activities

Social audit can be done by any stakeholder at any stage of the service delivery project/scheme. In the project, social audit process was contextualized via capacity building of community to use RTI Law 2013 and demand and access information related to water and sanitation schemes in district Mardan of the province, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The era of secrecy has been devolving with the light of information. The introductory meetings were helpful for the project to identify the potential communities. Many meetings were carried out with different communities amongst which the following communities were identified for the social audit process.

S No	District	Union Council	Village
1.	Mardan	Khazana Dheri	Kandaray
2.		Manga	Dheri
3.		Manga	Manga Khas
4.		Manga	Muslimabad
5.		Khazana Dheri	Khazana Dheri

Step-II:

Social Audit Scope

Social audit process has a wider scope and cannot be restricted. It differs from scheme to scheme, identified indicators can be different as in one scheme people are more interesting to know the infrastructural audit (the material used in the construction) while in some cases the focus may be on social indicators (the number of houses to be benefited from a water supply scheme).

Citizens of a country are more developed when they have more knowledge of/about their rights. In Pakistan, citizens are merely aware of their basic rights and the gap between government and citizens keep on increasing. Similarly citizens have less knowledge about the taxes they pay. It is important to aware the citizens about their money they pay to government in the form of taxes, for only then they can be able to arbitrate the social audit process.

Public services delivery is the prime focus of the government. Community were briefed on the mechanism of working of the government including the key responsibilities, access to public services, levels of the government hierarchy i.e. federal, provincial, district, tehsil, village etc.

Step- III

Community Awareness and Training on Social Audit

A total number of 41 awareness sessions were carried out in the project area. Awareness sessions were conducted at different phases of social audit process. At the start of the project,

the sessions were conducted to brief the community on the concept of social audit, constitutional rights, taxation, development budget etc. At the mid of the project, the awareness sessions were conducted to analyze the obtained information of the schemes while at the end of the project, awareness sessions were conducted to conclude the social audit process by generating the public demands. Apart from identifying the knowledge gaps, these initial community meetings proved fruitful in identifying activists who will conduct and introduce the concept and objectives of social audit. The details of the session are as;

S No	District	No of Sessions			No of Participants		
		Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total
1	Mardan	24	17	41	514	324	838

During the design process in initial community meetings, it was observed that community members have little or no understanding of Planning Commission (PC) documents. These documents spell out the entire detail of public projects from objectives of the projects to fund allocation and implementation activity details. Therefore an understanding of such documents becomes vital for social audits of public service delivery projects. Furthermore, lack of understanding about public procurement was also noted during the initial meetings with the community. Thus, it was decided to build the capacity of community by training citizens on participatory approach, public service delivery mechanism, social mapping, planning commission documents (PC) and public procurement along with RTI Law 2013.

Similarly the social mapping exercise helped out in identifying the schemes to be considered under social audit process.

Participatory Approach

Participatory approach is considered to be the most successful approach for making the contribution in development process. Social audit nurtures through participatory approach where communities collect, investigate and advocate for their rights. The communities were briefed on the successful examples of how across the globe communities change their lives.

Public Service Delivery Mechanism

Public service delivery is the prime focus of the government. Training covered the mechanism of working of the government including key responsibilities, access to public services, levels of the government hierarchy i.e. federal, provincial, district, tehsil, village etc. Decentralization and devolution through local government structure which has been recently installed.

Planning commission documents (PC)

Planning commission documents (PCs) are the main planning and execution documents in a development scheme. The communities were briefed on the five levels of planning commission documents i.e.

- ***Planning Commission (PC) 1***

District Department receives provincial Directives under which directions are cleared about the projects that will be identified by different MPAs. District Departments hold a number of meetings with the elected representatives for the identification of schemes. In the case of construction of a new school after the identification of elected representative (provision of land), District Education planning and development section carries feasibility report in which following indicators are considered.

- Proposed enrollment
- Distance from the other school
- Etc.

On the other hand, C&W department is responsible for the cost estimation of the scheme (school etc.) as a part of the PC1 and prepares Detailed Cost Estimates (DCE).

The feasibility report is discussed with District Education office and Education Provincial Secretariat and if found feasible it is approved.

- ***Planning Commission (PC) 2***

PC2 is normally done before PC1, and contains the following information

- Objective of the identified site
- Population spread
- Literacy rate (in case of education)
- Etc.

If the listed indicators are rationale to the policy objectives, PC2 is approved.

- ***Planning Commission (PC) 3***

After the approval of a scheme, the funds are released to the scheme dependent upon the nature. Monitoring process of the schemes starts with PC3. Regular monitoring visits are made to the scheme by the concerned and C&W Department. Funds are released on the submission of monitoring reports. Normally monitoring reports are submitted on quarterly bases but depending upon the nature of the development scheme.

- **Planning Commission (PC) 4**

PC4 contains the final completion report of the development scheme. PC4 is issued by concerned department, C&W Department and Finance Department. PC4 is the final completion report submitted for the final release of funds to the contractors and handling over of the scheme to the concerned department.

- **Planning Commission (PC) 5**

PC5 is an important phase of a scheme which contains post evaluation after the completion of a scheme. Normally it should be done 3-5 years after the completion of a scheme but unfortunately this exercise is never been in practice, even the post evaluation of big projects are never done.

Social Mapping

A detailed map of the targeted village was tracked in the trainings including different levels of service provisions i.e. federal and provincial schemes showing the estimated scheme costs. A detailed overview of the prioritized needs was focused through social mapping. The exercise gave an overview of the public service delivery in the targeted area. After analyzing the social mapping, different schemes were selected for social audit process in water and sanitation sectors with the concern of overall community. The selected schemes were as;

S No	District	Union Council	Village	Schemes
1.	Mardan	Manga	Dheri	Water supply scheme Dheri
2.		Manga	Muslimabad	Water supply scheme Muslimabad
3.		Khazana Dheri	Kandary	Water supply scheme Kandaray

Initially three schemes were selected under the project but later on two more schemes were added by the interest of adjacent villages/communities who were randomly engaged at the start of the project with the initial targeted communities. i.e.

S No	District	Union Council	Village	Schemes
4.	Mardan	Manga	Manga Khas	Water supply scheme Manga Khas
5.		Khazana Dheri	Khazana Dheri	Water supply scheme Khazana Dheri

Using KP Right to Information Act, 2013

KP government has embarked on good governance legislative framework. Right to Information (RTI) Act 2013, Local Government Act (LGA) 2013, and Right to Public Services Act 2014 have already been enacted.

KP RTI law was exercised by the communities to gather the information of the selected schemes. This was the most impressive exercise of the social audit process. The information

gathered was then analyzed by the communities. Following social and technical indicators were shared with the community. The reason behind sharing these indicators was to make the community understand the basis of performance evaluation of the selected social sector schemes and also to guide them appropriately in terms of the information requests. With the help of these indicators, communities were enabled to understand the nature of information required so that they could socially audit the selected schemes.

S No	Social Indicators	Technical Indicators
1.	Number of sanctioned posts	Record of Equipment's
2.	Status of building (rented/owned)	Repair and Maintenance record of vehicles
3.	Copy of paid electricity/telephone/gas/water utility bills	PC1
4.	Number of Vehicle	PC2
5.	Log book of Vehicles	PC3
6.	Number of employees with designation	PC4
7.	Detail of employees	PC5
8.	Employees attendance	Copy of original bills of payment
9.	Advertisement record of the posts	Copy of Cheques issued
10.	Status of equipment	Annual salary and non-salary budget copy
11.	Total number of schemes	Record of tendering process
12.	List of functional and non-functional schemes	Staff appointments

The communities requested 26 information requests under the process, of which unfortunately only 7 requests were directly responded by the departments while 13 complaints could get 9 responses after filling complaint to information commission Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The redressal of information requests was not time bound as specified in the KP RTI act. In most of the RTI applications, above mentioned indicators relating to a scheme were requested by the communities. Departments were more interested in repair and maintenance and functionalization of a scheme rather than responding to the requested information's. A brief table of information requests and responses is as;

Information	Total
RTI Requests	26
RTI Request Notices	7
RTI Responses (Information received)	10
Complaints	13

Information	Total
Complaints Response (Notices)	11
Commission Summons	0
Commission summon proceeding copy	0
Complaints Response (Information Received)	9
Inspection of Documents	0

However, communities keep on putting the information requests and hold their meetings to discuss the status of social audit process at every scheme.

Step IV

Data collection and Analysis:

Another significant step of social audit process was to analyze the obtained information of the selected schemes, the gathered data was never complete and comprehensive as most of the information requests were not timely and completely responded. In some cases, informal ways were used to get the relevant data. The information was analyzed in two stages. At first stage, the procurement documents were thoroughly analyzed for any embezzlement or misappropriation, and whether the procedures were followed as per the spirit of rules and regulations. In second stage, the specification mentions in the tender documents/procurement notices were compared with the physical delivery/structures of the development schemes.

It was not an easy task to analyze the technical indicators of various schemes for which community engaged the technical experts. The analyses mostly contained the following information;

- Planning commission documents
- Tendering process
- Contraction process
- Equipment specification vs installed equipment
- Material specified in the planning documents vs used material in the scheme
- Allocation vs Expenditures
- Staff appointments and benefits
- Reasons for dysfunctionality
- etc

The complete analysis findings were recorded to present it in public hearings with the line departments, local representatives, MPAs, media and other stakeholders.

Step V

Public Disclosure

It is the last stage of social audit process in which public demands were generated, the complete analysis of information analysis meetings were shared with different stakeholders i.e. MPAs, line departments, district administration, local government representatives, media and civil society via public hearing. A brief overview of the scheme by scheme analysis is as;

Water Supply Scheme kandaray

The water supply scheme Kandary was constructed in 1995-96 reflected in ADP (1995-96) scheme no 415 utilizing 1.439 million rupees but never functionalized. The community of kandary made efforts to functionalize the water supply scheme but their applications to MPAs and concerned department PHED were never responded.

Under the social audit process, first awareness Session was conducted on Apr 17, 2015, in which they were briefed on the social accountability tools through which they can demand their entitlements and rights and can make their service providers and public representatives accountable.

Community filed an Information request to the concerned department i.e. public health and engineering department (PHED) Mardan, in which they requested PC I to PC IV, a document that contains all the information about the scheme i.e. the area, location, funds allocation, ADP Year, quantity and quality of the material and utilization of funds etc. The information was not provided by the department. However, after launching the complaint to KP RTI Commission, the information was provided to the community. The information was analyzed by the community and discussed each and every head under which the scheme was executed. They put more RTI requests i.e.

- Tendering process
- Contraction
- Copy of electricity bills
- Staff details and appointments
- Repair and maintenance budget
- Causes for the dysfunctionality of a scheme
- Copies of payments (cheques) to contractor

The following information's were received after launching the complaints;

- Repair and maintenance budget
- Staff details

The other requested information's were not received even after launching the complaints to the KP RTI commission. However in next phase, communities started to analyze the collected information although it was not complete.

- It was noticed that the scheme was completed in year 1995-96 but never functionalized.
- The lifetime of the scheme was till 2017.
- The PC1 states that the scheme will provide clean drinking water to 11,593 citizens till 2017.
- The total budget of the scheme was Rs 1.132 million while the utilized budget was Rs. 1.432 million.
- Pumping machine was in running condition.
- Transfer and electric meter was installed and was in running condition.
- Pipelines distribution was damaged and some links were missing at some points.
- Three staff persons were appointed for the scheme since inception but on the ground only two staff members were seen at the scheme although the scheme operator runs a shop beside the scheme.
- The pipeline was damaged by the other departments (C&W) in construction of road, payment of streets, etc.
- A sum of Rs.6000 was collected at the start of the scheme from the communities under water connections but the record was not available with the department.
- Receipts of payments for water connections were available with few households.

While doing the social audit process, community was contacted by the PHED and a meeting was held between the department and community in which PHED asked the community to apply for the water connections after which the scheme will be functionalized. Moreover, the department committed to give free connections to the community and will not charge the fee for 1 year. Moreover, 20 free connections will be provided to communal places i.e. mosque, markets, janazagah, schools and hujras.

After the meeting with the department, 60 households applied for the water connections and the process is under way. The findings of the social audit process were shared in the public hearing where the local government representatives committed to follow up with the department on the concerned scheme to functionalize it.

Water supply scheme, Dheri

Water supply scheme Dheri was constructed in 2008-9 utilizing 4.953 million rupees but never functionalized. Under the social audit process community requested different information as;

- PC1
- Staff details and appointments
- Staff benefits
- Repair and maintenance budget
- Reasons for the dysfunctionality of the scheme
- Tender process
- Contraction process
- Details of payments to the contractor
- Copies of electricity bills

Only PC1 was directly provided by the department (PHE) while the following information's were received through KP right to information commission

- Staff details and appointments
- Reasons for the dysfunctionality of the scheme
- Electricity bills

After getting the required information, community analyzed the obtained information and it was found that:

- The scheme was constructed at the total budget Rs 4.953 million.
- The lifetime of the scheme was year 2029.
- There is only one employee i.e. operator cum watchmen, appointed under the scheme and has taken all the staff benefits after the appointment.
- Transformer and electricity meter are installed and are in running condition.
- The scheme is constructed in the household and public has no access to the scheme.
- A female embroidery center is also running in the chamber of the scheme.
- Distribution pipeline is damaged at various points of the scheme due to the installation of gas pipeline and street payments.
- The operator was appointed under the political affiliation of the previous government and there is strong drift between the community and the land owner.
- The tested water of other water sources in the village has been found highly contaminated.

Public health and engineering department was not providing the information to the community and in few cases misleading information was provided to the community. However, the department announced for the free connections but due to the political differences, neither the community nor the landowner were ready to functionalize the scheme with mutual understanding.

Water supply scheme Muslimabad

Water supply scheme Muslimabad was constructed in year 1996 but was started in year 2002 on trial bases but remained dysfunctional from late 2002 till date. The total expenditure incurred under the scheme was Rs 2.28 million. Community under social audit process selected the concerned scheme as the available water from the other sources was found highly contaminated. The water level is as high as 30 feet. Water borne diseases are at highest in the area. Community requested the following information under the social audit process;

- PC1, PC2, PC3, PC4

The information was not provided on the first RTI request to the community. However the information was provided on the second request by the community. Just after the second RTI request, department met with the community and requested them to not file RTI requests, the department will resolve all the issues of the community at their best on which the community stopped the information requests and asked the department to functionalize the water supply scheme.

PHED technical staff visited the community and inspected the water supply scheme after which they asked the community to request the WAPDA for the installation of electricity. Moreover, the PHED asked the community to apply for water connections on which community started to apply for water connections. More than 150 households were ready for water connections. Community was ready to pay the installation and monthly water charges but department committed to give free connections. Distribution line was fully damaged on which PHED committed to repair it after the installation of the electricity meter.

The process is still underway and the community is in close coordination with the department to functionalize the water supply scheme.

Conclusion

The social audit process can only be effectively persuaded when communities take the ownership and are motivated to improve public service delivery for which the initial dialogues are significant. At the start of the project, a number of initial meetings were held with different communities among which the more curious communities were selected. It was very important to make them understand the objectives of the social audit process. They were sensitized on the entitlements and rights they hold as citizens, followed by the tax structure which they pay for the public service provisions. Training on social audit was the important part of the social audit process in which social accountability tools were discussed. Social mapping was the main component of the training through which communities selected the schemes for social audit. KP Right to Information Act, 2013 was the key tool used for the collection of information. The collected information was analyzed by comparing the planning documents with the actual status of a scheme. The analyzed information was shared with the concerned stakeholders at public gatherings via Public hearing and public demands were generated. Moreover the communities have started social audit of other development projects in their areas and have filed information requests.

Objective of the project was to enable communities to practice the social audit process at their own for the existing schemes and as well as for any new scheme to be initiated. The project came up with a lot of challenges as it was the very first time that communities came up accounting a scheme with the planning documents. One can simply say that it was the social audit of planning vs execution. The challenges were already expected as the era of secrecy has dented the disclosure of public service delivery mechanism.

The main challenges faced are as;

- The community social audit actually strikes at the fault lines in the development planning. The elected representatives in provincial assembly promise more in terms of bricks and mortars than their actual responsibility to legislate and provide executive oversight. The political economy of development schemes dictate many executive functions by MPs. Development projects are used as bargaining tools between voters and MPs. The development schemes are approved with the consideration of voting patterns and not through the actual needs. Water and sanitation projects are approved to oblige voters. The MPs don't bother about areas from where he/she does not get votes. This goes totally against the development strategies which the provincial government harbingers at provincial level. Now mobilizing the community to hold the same MP accountable who once obliges them with a development scheme remains a challenge.

- KP government enacted KP RTI law in 2013. The law was celebrated as one of the key step in KP government good governance legislative agenda. However, the same house, which approved it, is now the main proving to be the main hurdle. The reason is, allocation of development to MPs under the constitution of Pakistan is unconstitutional. This is very much in practice in KP. That's why the KP RTI law faced its first blow when the assembly exempted itself from its purview. Now, the bureaucracy and political figures are in cahoots to block access to information which exposes direct MPs involvement in development funds. Water and sanitation projects are one of the key sectors where MPs are provided with development funds.
- Some of the public information officers didn't provide the relevant information, rather tried to influence the requestor to not file further information requests and in some cases provided the misleading/incomplete information. When CGPA approached the commission, they flatly refused to take on cases of misleading information. It took some time for CGPA to convince the information commission to take complaints related to incomplete/misleading information provided by public bodies.
- Departments were more interested in the repair and maintenance, functionalization of a scheme from funds outside their budget. This also depicts that those organisation which are providing funds to make government non-functional schemes functional are actually incentivizing corruption and mismanagement.
- In most of the cases, line departments did not have any record. Even after the information commission intervention, they took the plea that the requested information is not available.
- Female participation was another big challenge as the male community members monitor mostly development schemes. However, the awareness and sensitization enabled them to file RTI requests for their related issues.

The challenges were expected as social audit process scrutinizes the execution of development schemes in comparison to planning documents for which the service providers are often reluctant. On the other hand, project achievements came big as;

- Communities started filling information requests, not only for the schemes focused under CSA but also for their other service delivery issues. It may not seem a big outcome, but CGPA takes it as a positive indicator when citizens start asking about public service delivery from the public bodies. To put a question to public bodies, one need to find some issue related to public office. This defines the whole philosophy of how a citizen relates him/herself with state.
- Understanding of taxation, specifically indirect taxes boost the confidence of citizens to know about entitlements and demand them accordingly. This was the part where communities took deep interest in understanding how state generates revenue to

support its functions and locate themselves as rights holders and duty bearers. They also help start negotiating with public bodies in terms of demanding their rights and not as favour. The public health engineering department may not have yielded to improve services immediately; however they feel the accountability mechanism through which citizens can question them.

- Step by step social audit process was learnt by the communities which would enable them for future social audit of developmental schemes.
- Women equally participated in the project and also filled information requests under the social audit process.
- Initialization of a developmental scheme was learnt by the communities which included budget allocation, planning commission documents (PCs), tendering, contracting, billing and execution.
- The findings of each scheme was shared publically via public hearings and public demands were generated to relevant stakeholders including MPAs, local government representatives, line departments, media and civil society.
- Documentary developed under the project will promote the social audit concept in other areas and will help the citizens to understand the social audit process.
- The deep sense of community empowerment through the social audit process is very important outcome of the project. The community felt the acute sense of empowerment when the department approached them to make their dysfunctional scheme functional.
- The political economy of the development projects in Pakistan dictates that development work can't be carried out without voicing through powerful MPAs or Local Government representatives. The social audit processes challenge this set frame of development work. Now the MPAs and Local Government representatives are held accountable for their development work.
- The community audit process also generated debate on allocation development/constituency development funds to legislators. Overall, the project led to civic awareness of communities. However, the scope of such civic awareness needs to be expanded.

The recommendations for further implementation of social audit approach are as;

- Public money is wasted when there is not enough need of a project in the area and schemes are initiated for political scoring due to the reason mentioned in the challenges part. It is necessary to link the allocation of resources with the essential needs of the citizens which can only be possible if bottom up approach is adopted at policy level where needs are prioritized from the grass root level.

- A policy framework is required to link the infrastructural activities by the different departments. In most of the cases in water supply schemes, the distribution line was damaged by other infrastructural structures. i.e. sui gas, street pavements etc.
- The definition of functional and dysfunctional scheme in water and sanitation sector is required to be cleared as in most of the cases where pumping machine is in working condition is marked functional while the distribution line is damaged and citizens are not getting the clean drinking water.
- Capacities of line departments need to be developed to proactively disclose the relevant data. In most of the cases, department misled the requestor by not providing the desired data.
- Most of the schemes were found dysfunctional due to the political patronage of the landowners with influential political figures.
- There is a dire need of awareness on legislative laws i.e. Right to Information law, Right to services act etc. Awareness and capacity building on these laws can help in implementing the social audit process at broader level.
- Capacities of local government representatives need to be developed on the transparency laws which can help them in resolving the issues of the public they represent.
- The process needs time and comparatively larger scope to get more concrete results. The social audit can be more effective if focus is on UC or Tehsil level, and not on few development schemes. The community can then prioritize their development schemes for audit.

Annexures

Annexure - I : Sample RTI Request

تاریخ: 2015-06-08
پبلک انفارمیشن افسر
محکمہ - PHED گردان
پتہ - PHED، شمسی روڈ گردان
عنوان: درخواست برائے حصول معلومات بحوالہ فیبرکٹو گواہ معلومات تک رسائی کا قانون 2013

جناب عالی!

برائے مہربانی مجھے فیبرکٹو گواہ معلومات تک رسائی کے قانون 2013 کے تحت درج ذیل معلومات فراہم کریں۔

- 1- DWSS ڈھیری (دوہیں کنسل منگاہ ضلع گردان) کے ٹیلوب ویل پر لگائی گئی کل رقم (اخراجات) کی تفصیل
- 2- پمپنگ چیمبر (Pumping chamber) پر آنے والے اخراجات، کل رقم اور اس کی تفصیل
- 3- External electrification اور Pumping Machinery پر صرف شدہ رقم اور ان کی تفصیل
- 4- ڈھیری گاؤں کے DWSS کی ڈسٹری بیوشن سسٹم پر صرف شدہ رقم کی تفصیل، اور پائپ کی معیار اور مقدار کی تفصیلات۔

الغرض

اسلام نگر -
شناختی کارڈ نمبر - 1-1909355-1601
پتہ - گاؤں ڈھیری کلک، P 5 منگاہ ضلع تحصیل گردان
فون نمبر - 0346-9346674


Annexure – II : Water Testing Result



Water Testing Result

S.#	Village	Source	Date	Parameters Tested						Remarks
				pH	EC	TDS	Free Cl	Turb	E.Coli	
1	Muslim Abad	Not Mention	6-Mar-15	7.8	577	295	0	2.11	0	Safe for drinking
2	Kandari Jadeed	Not Mention	6-Mar-15	7.6	718	341	0	3.4	0	Safe for drinking
3	Dheri Kalli	Not Mention	6-Mar-15	7.6	996	467	0	4.42	0	Safe for drinking
4	Manga Khas	Not Mention	6-Mar-15	7.5	1047	498	0	3.96	17	Bacteriological Contaminated & needs chlorination on urgent basis
5	Palolo	Not Mention	6-Mar-15	7.5	1216	563	0	3.29	2	Bacteriological Contaminated & needs chlorination on urgent basis
6	Khazana Koz Jumat	Not Mention	6-Mar-15	7.7	956	433	0	3.53	0	Safe for drinking
7	khazana Sikandar	Not Mention	6-Mar-15	7.6	853	389	0	2.25	1	Bacteriological Contaminated & needs chlorination on urgent basis
WHO standards				6.5-8.5	1000 µS/cm	1000 µS/cm	0.2- 0.5mg/ L	≤ 5 NTU	0 CFU/ 100ml	

Grade	Count/100ml	Risk
A	0	WHO guideline value, no risk, no action
B	1-10	Low risk, need action & follow-up
C	11-50	Intermediate to high risk, need immediate
D	>50	Gross pollution, high risk, suspend the sou

Counter Signed By: 
 Manager Water Quality & Research



Annexure – III: Media Coverages



Social audits of education, health sectors stressed

Reed Shiwani
 Representative Speakers in a meeting seminar asked participants to hold themselves responsible for making social audits of various development schemes and activities in education, health and public health sectors and make effective utilization of rights to Information (RTI, 2013) for getting information. Offices of education department, public health and engineering, water and sanitation services Peshawar (WSP) Municipal Corporation, Councilors of Peshawar and others attended the program which was organized by center for governance and public accountability (CGPA).

In a youth councilor health sector Union Council of Peshawar, Reed Shih while speaking on the occasion said a government girl primary school in the area has been closed down since 2006, and around 200 girls enrolled in the school have been deprived of their education. He only said the female teachers were not performing their duties properly and that the future of hundreds of students at stake.

Regarding government girls middle school Mehran Gu, he said at least 500 girl students had been reading in the school which needs to be reopened because there is no any high school in the area distance of 15 to 20 kilometers. There are some other schools where female teachers do not come for their duties and students were compelled to leave their educational activities, he added.

Representative of the Khas Union Council of Peshawar, said that a smaller kind of government primary school for boys has been renamed closed since long and a number of children are growing up without getting education. He informed they had submitted several applications with education department but in vain. There are some other primary schools in the area with absence of social Mangers away from them, he added.

However participants from AICD About Union Council, Gas Sherdar Union Council and others also presented their problems with respect to education, health and water schemes and also said that they have been educated by offices of CGPA with regard to social audits and making possible use of RTI law, 2013. The organization, they said had a list while holding them responsible for keeping, proper development activities, educational activities and also health.

M. Gulzar, Assistant District Education Officer (ADO) for girls in Peshawar while responding to various questions raised saying that 125 female teachers have been handed over to HTs and after recruitment of fresh female teachers, the issue would be resolved. She also said public reference by former ministers and MPAs was underway in transfer and postings of lady teachers. She further said the matter about absence of teachers, boundary walls and others would be solved by end of 2016 and initiatives are being taken for additional improvement in education sector. Stressing the participants, she said the community members should hold themselves responsible in some issues and they should play their due role and create awareness among masses about education, health and others.

Engineer Representative of Public Health and Engineering Department (PHED) Peshawar said they had introduced several projects aimed at providing potable water to cities. He assured residents of various union councils on the occasion saying the closed water schemes would be fixed functional and completed in the respect would be successful.

M. Azam, Zonal Manager of WSP, Shih, Assistant Municipal Officer Planning Peshawar and CGPA, Budget Analyst Nazim Haid also offered speeches on the occasion. Nazim Haid on the occasion said center for governance & public accountability (CGPA) has initiated a social audit project where community leads the social audit process by taking into account some technical and social aspects of a public provision in shape of a school, water supply scheme, etc.



Annexure – IV: Pictures Gallery



Citizens sharing their views in Public Hearing



Community at Village Kandaray discussing Social Audit process



Community discussion on the status of water supply scheme Khazana Dheri



Community in an awareness session discussing KP RTI Act



Community meeting at Village Hassan Kalay



Community of village kandaray analyzing the water supply scheme information



Community of Village Kandary being briefed on Socail Audit



Community of Village Khazana Dheri being briefed on Socail Audit



Community of village Muslimabad analyzing the information



Community session on KP local government act, 2013



Community writing an RTI application for Khazana Dheri water supply scheme



Community writing an RTI application for Muslimabad water supply scheme



Initial community meeting at villahe Manga



Participants of Social Audit training in village Dheri presenting their group work



Public Hearing at Village Manga



Women at Public hearing



Centre for Governance and Public Accountability (CGPA) is not for profit, non-governmental, civil society organization. CGPA strives for inclusive development and promotion of peace through right based and governance