

# Community Social Audit of Health and Water/Sanitation Sectors

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa



# **Community Social Audit of Health and Water/Sanitation Sectors**

**Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**

**Social Audit Report  
PHED Laki Marwat, Karak and DHQ Laki Marwat**

**Centre for Governance and Public Accountability (CGPA)**

## Table of Contents

Background .....	1
Social Audit in District Karak and Laki Marwat .....	1
Formation of Social Audit Committees .....	1
Training of the SAC Members.....	2
Filing of RTI Requests.....	2
Information Analysis and Key Findings .....	3
District Headquarter Hospital Laki Marwat.....	4
PHED Laki Marwat.....	6
PHED Karak.....	7
Justice sector .....	8
Community Awareness and Mobilization .....	9
Public Hearings.....	9

## **Background**

Community Social Audit (CSA) is a powerful tool to hold the public service providers accountable. Centre for Governance and Public Accountability (CGPA) has been using this tool for the past four years for strengthening citizens' voice on key development and service delivery issues. The main thrust has been to improve public service delivery and trust between the state and society. The state citizen divide can be bridged when government plays its key facilitator role in provision of services and protection of citizens' rights. When citizens can hold government functionaries accountable for their responsibilities, it creates a healthy environment for democratic process. Neither the government can accomplish much without an active citizenry involvement in all stages of policy formulation and implementation, nor can the citizens benefit from the government policies unless they are provided space and tools to hold their elected representatives and service providers accountable. Provision of basic services to citizens is the primary responsibility of state and the fundamental right of citizens. These entitlements are fully spelled out under the fundamental rights chapter of the constitution of Pakistan.

In 2018-19, CGPA focus remained on the instrumental use of RTI for improving health and justice services. KP RTI law has been in its sixth year of enactment. During the time it has come up with a number of achievements that has benefited public in various ways. Mostly the Act has been used individually to address different personal issues like seeking selection criteria for jobs, seniority list, posting and transfers etc. however the act has not been effectively used to address the public issues. As the social audit concept strikes to the collective approach of public issues at large, therefore CGPA carried out community social audits in district Karak and Laki Marwat of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province. CGPA finalized two sectors i.e Health and Public health & engineering department in the target two districts. These two sectors were finalized in consultation with social audit committees established by CGPA in the target two districts.

## **Social Audit in District Karak and Laki Marwat**

CGPA carried out social audit in district Laki Marwat and Karak. Two public sectors were selected in consultation with committee members and other activist in the area. The selected sectors were District Headquarter Hospital Laki Marwat and Public Health & Engineering department in district Karak and Laki Marwat. The social audit of DHQ karak has already been carried out by CGPA in 2017. The social audits were carried out in partnership with KP Right to Information Commission.

## **Formation of Social Audit Committees**

As a first step, CGPA formed the district Social Audit Committees (SACs) in both focus districts. The social organizers held a number of meetings with civil society members, LG representatives, political parties activists. The idea of CSA was floated and the persons were asked to select their representatives for the committee.

Once the committee members were finalized, they were asked to select the development schemes or any service delivery for the community social audit.

## Training of the SAC Members

A comprehensive training of the SAC was organized in Laki Marwat and Karak on September 25-26 and 27-28, 2019 to train the committee members on the CSA processes. They were briefed about the basic philosophy that whatever governments do, the money actually comes from their taxes. Then they were briefed about direct/indirect taxes, budget formation process, process of initiation development project, approval of project documents (PC-1), roles of different public bodies, role of elected representatives, and how to use Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Act 2013 for accessing such information.

Two training workshops were organized, one each in Laki Marwat and Karak, where 36 participants including 13 women were trained on different process of social audit. Through social mapping the committee members finalized the public provisions to be audited which included



S No	Distret	Sector
1.	Karak	PHED
2.	Laki Marwat	PHED
3.	Laki Marwat	DHQ Hospital

## Filling of RTI Requests

The community used KP RTI law for obtaining information from the selected public bodies. This was the basic exercise of the social audit process. The committee members then analyzed the information gathered. Following social and technical indicators were shared with the community. The reason behind sharing these indicators was to make the community understand the basis of performance evaluation of the selected public bodies and also to guide them appropriately in terms of the information requests. With the help of these indicators community members were able to easily understand the nature of information required, so that they could socially audit the public bodies.

S No	Social Indicators	Technical Indicators
1.	Number of sanctioned posts	Record of Equipment's
2.	Attendance record of staff from July 2017 to June, 2018.	Attendance register or Bio metric attendance record
3.	Record of employees who are on long leave. Duration of leaves	Leave record

S No	Social Indicators	Technical Indicators
4.	Total number of water supply schemes under PHED along with status (Functional – Dysfunctional).	PC2
5.	Details of current budget allocated to PHED Lakki Marwat for the financial year 2017-18.	Budge copy
6.	Details of expenditure of the current budget for the financial year 2017-18 along with break up.	Expense report and other relevant record
7.	Details of developmental budget allocated to PHED Lakki Marwat for the financial year 2017-18.	PC2
8.	Details of expenditure of the developmental budget for the financial year 2017-18 along with break up.	Copy of original bills of payment
9.	Details of water and other charges collection from the public scheme wise for FY 2017-18.	Revenue record
10.	List of Contractors registered with PHED Lakki Marwat	Certified list of registered contractors
11.	Summary of contracts (Amount wise) given to the Contractors for the FY 2017-18.	Record of tendering process
12.	Total Sanctioned posts in DHQ Lakki Marwat along with details of filled and vacant positions along with dates	Staff appointments record
13.	Duty Roaster of Doctors and paramedical Staff from July 2017 to June, 2018.	Repair and Maintenance budget
14.	Record of employees who are on long leave. Duration of leaves	Leave record

### Information Analysis and Key Findings

Another significant step of social audit process was to analyze the information provided by the selected public -bodies; the data provided by the selected public bodies was never complete and comprehensive. As most of the information requests were not responded timely and the

data provided was also not sufficient as required. To get the information, some informal ways were also adopted, and hence there is still a huge gap in implementation of KP RTI Law at various levels.

Analysis of information provided by the selected public bodies was carried out jointly by the CGPA team and members of the Social Audit Committees the analyses mostly contained the following information;

The complete analysis findings were recorded to present it in public hearings with the line departments, local representatives, MPAs, media and other stakeholders.

A brief overview of the social audit findings is given as under:

### **District Headquarter Hospital Laki Marwat**

- Number of referred cases from July 2017 to June 2018 is **213**.
- Number of expiries from July 2017 to June 2018 are **54**.
- There are two ambulances and are functional.
- The provided Log Books of ambulances Reg No LM 1075 and 1065 is well maintained.
- Detail of income generated from services of ambulances has not provided by the DHQ Laki Marwat
- Copy of repair & maintenance and budget sanctioned and utilized for ambulances and other official vehicles from July 2017 to June 2018 not provided by DHQ Laki Marwat. Although they provided the expenses made on account of maintenance of vehicles. As per information provided by DHQ Laki total expenses made for maintenance of 2 vehicle in 2017-18 are Rs.532860/-. ( Rs.4,23,880 for ambulance LM 1065 and remaining amount Rs.108980 for LM 1075)
- Total sanctioned post in DHQ lakki marwat is **503**, filled posts are **341** and vacant posts are **162**.

The following table shows detail of vacant posts as per information provided by DHQ Laki Marwat for the year 2017-18.

<b>Name Of Vacant Post</b>	<b>Number Of Vacant Post</b>	<b>BPS</b>
principal Medical Officer	11	19
Anesthetist	1	18
Senior District Specialist Nephrology	1	18
District Specialist psychiatrist	1	18
DMS	2	19
gynecologist	1	18
Medical Specialist	1	18
Pathologist	1	19
senior district specialist physician	1	18
Gastroenterologists	11	18
Trauma Surgeon	1	18
Urologist	1	18
Senior Medical Officer	9	18

Name Of Vacant Post	Number Of Vacant Post	BPS
Dental Surgeon	5	17
MO/ GDMO	41	17
Optometrist	1	17
Pharmacist	1	17
Social Welfare Officer	1	17
Head Nurse	1	17
Nursing Superintendent	1	17
Charge Nurse	64	16
CT Dental	2	12
CT Anesthesia	3	12
CT Surgical	3	12
CT Physiotherapy	1	12
Physiotherapy Technician	1	12
Electrician Grade 3	1	10
Electro Medical Technician	1	12
Sterilization Assistant/ Anesthesia	1	10
Driver	1	6

- Attested copy of duty roster has been provided, to verify the duty roster, the members of social audit committee Karak planned random visits to DHQ Laki Marwat, where they found all the staff present as per the roster provided by DHQ Laki Marwat.
- Attendance record of staff has been provided.
- No employee is on long leave from July 2017 to June 2018.
- Total number of functional wards in DHQ lakki marwat is **05**.
- Total number of beds in DHQ lakki marwat are **200**
  - Surgical Ward : **20 beds**
  - Eye Ward : **20 beds**
  - Medical Ward **20 beds**
  - Dengue + Children Stabilization ward : **20 beds**
  - Emergency Ward: **20 beds**.

As per information provided by DHQ Laki Marwat, there are 200 beds, where 100 beds are in use.

- No incinerator is available in DHQ Lakki Marwat. The waste is managed by dumping.
- Attested copy of current budget is provided. The provided information shows expenditure in the year 2017-18, while the allocated budget is missing. Total expenditure is 216526971/- in the financial year 2017-18. Out of total current expenditure salary is Rs177,037,796 while non- salary is Rs39,489,175.
- Total number of admitted patient from July 2017 to June 2018 in DHQ Lakki Marwat is **2,675**.
- Total number of deliveries from July 2017 to June 2018 is **57**.
- Total number of C-Sections conducted in DHQ Laki Marwat in the 2017-18 is **03**.



- Attested copy of functional and dysfunctional equipment has been provided by DHQ Lakki Marwat.
- The following medical equipment is dysfunctional in DHQ Lakki marwat while mobile C- arm imaging intensifier is still to be supplied.
  - 24 hours BP Monitor Machine ABPM50
  - Contac Medical System
  - Endoscope Gastro Duodenal Model and
  - Ultra sound machine
- Total number of OPD Patients from July 2017 to June 2018 are **164,554/-**
- Income generated from OPD from July 2017 to June 2018 is **Rs. 1626150/-**
- Copy of the provided information regarding purchased medicines and stock register was tallied and it was found that the purchased medicines were distributed among the patients and the daily medicine expense register was updated accordingly.
- Verified copy of tests performs in laboratory and a chemical used in different medical test has been provided. The information shows that the DHQ has the facility for performing 28 types of tests in its laboratory.

### **PHED Laki Marwat**

- Copy of developmental budget allocated to PHED Lakki marwat for financial year 2017-18 is provided. The total allocated developmental budget to PHED for the year 2017-18 is Rs. 3,31,664,900/.
- The PHED Laki Marwat failed to provide the information requested regarding the expenditure of development budget for the year 2017-18
- Copy of water and other charges collection from the public scheme for financial year 2017-18 is provided.

There are total 786762 rural populations in district Laki Marwat while 529848 population has access to safe drinking water. the number of tube- wells in district Laki Marwat is 455 and water tanks are 27. There is no water supply and sanitation schemes approved in the financial year 2017-18.

PHED Laki Marwat collected total revenue of amount Rs. 1117840/- from the public schemes in the year 2017-18.

- Copy of list of contractors registered with PHED is provided. There are total 33 contractors registered with PHED laki marwat.
- The requested information regarding amount given to contractors on accounts of contracts with different contractors for the financial year 2017-18. ( amount wisummary of contracts)
- PHED Laki Marwat failed to provide the requested information refarding details of schemes allocated to each MPA/MNA in district lakki marwat
- As per information provided by PHED laik Marwat, there is no scheme handed over to PHED laki Marwat developed under the Barani Project.
- As per information provided by PHED Laki Marwat, there are total 3 vehicles having registration number **AA-1711 Peshawar, A-2307 and A-3772 Peshawar**, among these

vehicle only one vehicle bearing registration No AA-1711 in on road while the remaining two are off road.

- Copy of equipments is not provided.
- As per information provided by PHED Laki Marwat regarding statement of water charges, against the target amount of Rs 5826000, there are total amount of Rs.301000 collected. The shortfall for the year 2017-18 is 5525000
- Total sanctioned post in PHED lakki marwat is not provided.
- The PHE Department provided the requested information regarding Attendance record of it staff from July 2017 to June 2018. The record shows 100% attendance of the staff.
- Total number of water schemes under PHED along with status of functional and dysfunctional are not provided.
- PHED Laki Marwat did not provide the information requested regarding details of expenditure of the current budget for financial year 2017-18 along with break up.

### **PHED Karak**

- There are total 1103 sanctioned posts in PHED Karak and all these posts are filled.
- The attendance record provided by PHED Krak shows 100 % attendance of its entire staff. The attendance record also shows that no employee is on long leave.
- There are total 494 water supply schemes in Karak under the PHED Karak. out of these, 43 are dys- functional and 451 are functional.
- As per information provided by PHED Karak regarding the details of current budget allocated to PHED for the year 2017-18, the allocated current budget is **Rs – 23, 05,61,857.**
- The information provided by PHED Karak shows Rs. 230,561,857 as expenditure of the current budget for the year 2017-18.
- The PHED Karak share the same amount of **Rs.23, 05, 61,857** as allocated and expenditure of development budget for the year 2017-18.
- The information provided by PHED Karak shows **Rs – 611340** as water and other charges collection from the public scheme for Financial year 2017-18
- There are 47 Contractors registered with PHED karak.
- Amount wise summary of contracts to different contractors for the year 2017-18 has been provided by PHED Karak. the summary shows 115 developmental schemes including water supply schemes, solarization of existing water supply scheme,solarization of filtration plants,street pavements,installation of hand pumps etc.
- Regarding the information about details of scheme allocated to each MPA/MNA in district karak in the financial year 2017-18.the information shows that,six development schemes have been sponsored by Malikq Qasim Khan MPA PK 41, out of Chief Minister Directives vide DC approval.No 9930/DCK/DA/DDC/AA dated 26/9/2017
- No Scheme handed over to this division under barani project.
- The requested copy of vehicle log book has not provided by PHED Karak.
- The amount of budget allocated to PHED karak for repair and maintenance of vehicle for Financial year 2017-18 is **Rs – 3,50,000**

## Justice sector

Despite several reforms in the justice sector, the pendency in the lower courts is still a huge bottleneck. Justice sectors reforms have not been able to tackle this issue. Due to lack of awareness, the citizens are also not often able to know about the performance of district courts.



CGPA filed information requests to district and session's judges in all districts of KP and Punjab under the KP RTI Law 2013 and Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act 2013 respectively. The requested information were regarding total pendency, pendency in criminal cases, pending in civil cases, total budgets allocated to district courts, case disposal ratio etc.

The received information were thoroughly analyzed and made public through press release in different News Papers, social media and CGPA website. This is pertinent to mention that most of the district courts in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provided the requested information on the directives of Peshawar High Court. The district & Session Judge Lahore is the only judge who provided the information in Punjab.

Total 167,999 cases are pending in 22 Districts Courts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The information collected by Centre for Governance and Public Accountability (CGPA) through Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Act 2013 depicts 167,999 civil and criminal cases were pending in district courts in 22 districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa as on June 30, 2018. Peshawar district has 31,172 cases pending followed by Nowshera district with total 29,306 cases pending in district courts.

The data depicts that number of total civil cases pending in 22 districts as on June 30, 2018 were 94,385 while total criminal pending cases are 73,614. Compared to other districts, Nowshera district has recorded the highest pendency in criminal cases. Nowshera district had 17,712 criminal pending cases followed by Peshawar district with 14,414 pending criminal cases as on June 30, 2018. Mardan district had total 7,294, Bannue 4,188, Swabi 4,185, Haripur 3,890, Karak 3,342, and Mansehra 3,108 pending criminal cases. Shangla and Torghar had the lowest pendency in criminal pending cases with only 261 and 353 cases respectively. Similarly, Peshawar district had the highest number of pending civil cases e.g. 16,758 as on June 30, 2018, followed by Nowshera with 11,594 pending civil cases. Mardan district had total 10,600, Haripur 7,076, Mansehra 6,499, Kohat 4,798, Swabi 6,347, Bannu 4,298, Karak 4,088 and Hangu 3,166 pending civil cases. 25 Information Requests were filed to all district courts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to provide information on the number of pending civil and criminal cases. All districts courts, except district and session courts of Swat, Charsadda and D.I.Khan provided the information. The complaints against these courts are pending with Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Commission.



## Community Awareness and Mobilization

The trained Committee members conducted awareness sessions in both the target districts on different stages of the social audit process. Total 60 awareness sessions were conducted in the target districts. At the start of the project the sessions were conducted to brief the community on the concept of social audit, RTI, constitutional rights, taxation, development budget, health provisions etc. At the mid of the project the awareness sessions were conducted to analyze the information received from the selected public bodies while at the end of the project, awareness sessions were conducted to conclude the social audit process by generating the public demands for accountable public service delivery. The details of the session are;

S.No	District	No of Sessions			No. of Participants		
		Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total
1	Karak	20	10	30	350	192	540
	Laki Marwat	20	10	30	347	283	639

## Public Hearings

This the last stage of social audit process in which public demands were generated. A public hearing was held. The analysis carried out under social audit process of the target public bodies were shared with different stakeholders i.e. MPAs, line departments, district administration, local government representatives, media and civil society via public hearing. Representatives of the target public bodies gave their responses on the findings of the social audit process while the local government representatives assured their role as per the LG Act for improving service delivery mechanism.



The LG representatives also appreciated the CGPA for introducing this idea of social audit by the community members, which can really change the mindset of public officials as well as honor the community to ask about their rights. They also assured their role in bridging the gaps between the line departments and citizens.

It was noted at the public hearings that the issues and problems pertaining to the social audit provisions were not possible to be addressed at district level therefore a provincial seminar was conducted in which all the stakeholders at district and provincial level participated. Chief Information Commissioner, MS DHQ Laki Marwat, representatives from PHED Laki marwat and Karak, LG representatives, Medi representatives participated in the seminar



**CGPA**

CENTRE FOR GOVERNANCE  
AND PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY

[www.c-gpa.org](http://www.c-gpa.org)